



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
LAW DEPARTMENT
100 Church Street
NEW YORK, NY 10007

MURIEL GOODE-TRUFANT
Corporation Counsel

JOSEPH ZANGRILLI
Phone: (212) 356-2657
Fax: (212) 356-3509
jzangril@law.nyc.gov
Senior Counsel

May 23, 2025

BY ECF

Honorable Ona T. Wang
United States Magistrate Judge
United States District Court
Southern District of New York
500 Pearl Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: Robert Murray v. City of New York, et al.,
24 Civ. 4918 (JLR) (OTW)

Your Honor:

I am a Senior Counsel in the Office of Corporation Counsel Muriel Goode-Trufant, representing defendant City of New York (the “City”). I write (i) to provide the Court and Plaintiff with updated service addresses for the Department of Correction (“DOC”) personnel identified in the City’s September 23, 2024 and April 11, 2025 *Valentin* responses (ECF Nos. 13, 46),¹ and (ii) respectfully request that the Court employ the same procedure that the Honorable Lewis J. Liman adopted in *Murray v. City of New York*, 21 Civ. 6718 (LJL). There, because Plaintiff paid the filing fee—as he has done here—the Court Ordered that he complete service on the individual defendants within ninety (90) days pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(m) and deem such service timely if completed within that period. (*See Order, Id.*, ECF No. 131, Apr. 2, 2025).

By way of background, Plaintiff originally commenced this action *in forma pauperis* (“IFP”). On December 16, 2024, after Plaintiff voluntarily remitted the full \$405 filing fee, the Court denied the City’s motion to revoke *IFP* status as moot

¹ Notably, Plaintiff filed a related state court action, *Murray v. City of New York*, Index No. 811739/2024E (Bronx Cty. Sup. Ct.), on July 25, 2024—just two days after this Court’s July 23, 2024 *Valentin* order (ECF No. 7) and before the City had appeared in this federal case. (*See* ECF No. 11, dated September 17, 2024). That state court complaint already contained the names and shield numbers of the individual DOC defendants involved in the alleged April 26, 2023 and April 27, 2023 incidents, indicating that Plaintiff possessed the identifying information for these defendants independent of, and prior to, the City’s *Valentin* responses.

(ECF No. 30).² The docket reflects that, as of the date of this letter, no summonses have been issued since the fee was paid.

Consistent with Rule 4(m) and § 1915(d), and mirroring the procedure adopted in *Murray v. City of New York*, 21 Civ. 6718 (LJL)—where, after Plaintiff paid the filing fee, the Honorable Lewis J. Liman directed Plaintiff to serve the individual defendants at the addresses provided by the City within ninety (90) days (*see* Order, ECF No. 131, Apr. 2, 2025)—the City respectfully proposes that the Court:

1. Direct Plaintiff to serve each individual defendant at the addresses supplied below within 90 days of the Court’s Order;
2. Deem such service timely if completed within that deadline; and
3. Order that any individual defendant served within the 90-day period shall answer or otherwise respond to the complaint no later than 21 days after that period expires.

To facilitate plaintiff’s service of the individual defendants, and in consideration of the amount of time that has passed since the City’s initial partial response, the City provides the following up-to-date addresses at which the individual defendants may be served.

Captain Berton Williams, Shield No. 695; Captain Osarogiagbon Edemakhiopa, Shield No. 1713; Correction Officer Brandon McNealy, Shield No. 5331; Correction Officer Jose Estevez, Shield No. 13668; Correction Officer Donald Derrick Jr., Shield No. 5026; Correction Officer Derrick Stephens, Shield No. 5292; Correction Officer Raymond Munoz, Shield No. 14668; and Correction Officer Omar Smith, Shield No. 18633 may be served at **Otis Bantum Correctional Center, 16-00 Hazen Street, East Elmhurst, NY 11370**.

Correction Officer Aldon Grant, Shield No. 6701, may be served at **Eric M. Taylor Center, 10-10 Hazen Street, East Elmhurst, NY 11370**.

Captain Gbenga Gbenjo, Shield No. 1434 (promoted from Correction Officer Shield No. 4434); Correction Officer Daniel Eudes, Shield No. 18208; Correction Officer Ernst Bonhomme, Shield No. 12971; Correction Officer Isolina Liriano, Shield No. 13592; Correction Officer David Lau, Shield No. 13040; and Correction Officer Mohammed Alam, Shield No. 6006 may be served at **North Infirmery Command, 15-00 Hazen Street, East Elmhurst, NY 11370**.

² Plaintiff has filed at least nine federal civil rights lawsuits in this District in the past four years, and the City’s *IFP* revocation motion was ultimately granted in another of Plaintiff’s cases, *Murray v. City of New York*, 24 Civ. 3758 (JGLC) (SDA), on April 4, 2025, based on the “three strikes” provision of the Prison Litigation Reform Act. Most recently, Chief Judge Swain dismissed Plaintiff’s newest action, *Murray v. City of New York*, 25 Civ. 3629 (LTS), on May 6, 2025, finding that Plaintiff is barred from filing actions *IFP* while incarcerated due to his accumulated strikes under 28 U.S.C. § 1915(g). (Order of Dismissal, ECF No. 5, May 6, 2025).

Correction Officer Thomson Milien, Shield No. 4740, may be served at **West Facility, 16-06 Hazen Street, East Elmhurst, NY 11370.**

Correction Officer Raymond Ortiz, Shield No. 12861, is no longer with the department. DOC is currently working to contact Mr. Ortiz to obtain a designation of agent for service of process. At this time, we do not have a current service address for this defendant, but will promptly notify the Court and Plaintiff once contact is established and a service address is available.

For the reasons above, the City respectfully requests that the Court issue an Order (i) directing Plaintiff to serve the individual defendants at the addresses provided within 90 days and deeming service timely if completed within that period, and (ii) directing that any individual defendant served within the 90-day period shall answer or otherwise respond to the complaint no later than 21 days after the 90-day period expires.

Respectfully Submitted,

Joseph Zangrilli /s/

Joseph Zangrilli
Attorney for Defendant City
Senior Counsel
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356-2657
jzangril@law.nyc.gov

Cc: **VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL**
Robert Lee Murray
B&C: 9902300038
George R. Vierno Center
09-09 Hazen Street
East Elmhurst, NY 11370